

Conference Summary



Eric Charles SLAC National Lab.

13^{eme} Recontres de Vietnam:
"Exploring the Dark Universe"
29 July 2017, Quy Nhon, Vietnam



- Introduction
 - Theme I: new data / new models / new questions
 - Theme II: communication between communities
- A high level tour of science topics with various personal biases and a few random asides
- Meta Summary



THEMES: NEW DATA / NEW MODELS / NEW QUESTIONS



New Data Tests Existing Models & Methods



Meta level: "WIMP 'Miracle' seems pretty compelling, lets start by going out and looking for 100 GeV WIMPs."



New Data Push us to New Models & Methods



Meta level: "Well, none of use have found these 100 GeV WIMPs. How do we look for those XX you mentioned?"

Sterile v			Primordial Black Holes			PeV DM
	Axions & ALPS		Spin-2 Fields		Asymmetric DM	



New Models & Methods raises New Questions



Meta level: "Oh, XX is a rich model space, and in looking for it we are learning lots of new things"



- This conference brings together people for multiple communities:
 - Accelerator-based
 - Direct-detection
 - High-Energy Astronomy / Astrophysics
 - Cosmology
 - Particle Theory / phenomenology
- We all had to take a step back and focus on things that will be of interest to people outside our specific communities
 - I hope this talk follows in that spirit, i.e., I'm not going to be saying a lot about nano-Bq / kg, pseudo-rapidity cuts, or γ-ray telescope instrument response functions



SCIENCE TOPICS



- Intro & Keynote
- Dark matter theory
- Searches
 - Accelerator Searches
 - Light DM at e⁺e⁻ colliders & fixed target experiments
 - Searches at the LHC
 - Direct detection:
 - Direct detection of WIMPs
 - Directional Detection
 - Direct detection of WISPs, ALPs & axions
 - Indirect detection:
 - Indirect detection with neutrinos
 - Indirect detection with γ rays
 - Indirect detection with charged particles
- Cosmology & Astrophysical Dark Matter



INTRO & KEYNOTE



Keynote Lecture by G. 't Hooft



Virtual black holes and space-time foam (Summary)

Virtual black holes must be everywhere in space and time. Due to vacuum fluctuations, amounts of matter that can contract to become black holes, must occur frequently. They also evaporate frequently, since they are very small. This produces small vacuoles in the space-time fabric. How to describe multiple vacuoles is not evident. The emerging picture could be that of "space-time foam":



- Explained motivation for fundamental new ingredients in quantum treatment of black holes: gravitational back reaction, spherical harmonics expansion of in-, out-going particles, antipodal identication.
- Some quotes:
 - "Space has become time, and time has become space"
 - "This is a pure state only if you combine universe 1 with universe 2"
 - "A time Mobius strip ... this rescues unitarity & causality."



Introduction





Direct, Indirect, Accelerator-based Searches





THEORY



SUSY Phenomenlogy



- Massive efforts underway to explore the massive SUSY parameter space
- Identify DM candidates (i.e., the lightest SUSY particle) for different scenarios
- Explore representative simplified models to probe SUSY space









Simplified Models





Light Higgs Favors High Mass SUSY



 For an optimistic, the low mass of the Higgs means that the favored SUSY mass scale is high, which helps to explain why we haven't seen it at LHC, and could be great news for Cerenkov Telescope Array (CTA)



Specific Theoretical Developments



- Parts of parameters space for which DM interactions at LHC would be "long-range", implying bound states have important effect on phenomenology, boosting the LHC mass reach Petraki
- Self consistent solutions where spin 2 fields behave as DM. Available parameters space could be closed with factor of 100 improvement in limits on DM decay Urban
- PeV DM is feasible in rich dark sector theories and should be explored in more detail Sala



SEARCHES



DIRECT DETECTION











Impressive Efforts to Address Instrumentation Challenges

24



• Common themes: reducing background radiation, thermal noise, increasing fiducial volume, mixing new and tested technologies



Some Developments that Stood Out (for me)



- v-floor is much lower for C_3F_8 than for Xe
- Using resonance effect to go beyond diffractive limit in emulsion resolution
- Adding minority carriers to measure drift time start time (z-position)



Direct Detection: High-Mass WIMP Searches



- Flagship liquid noble detectors continue to bravely push down to the neutrino floor
- Given the background level required, this is a truly impressive achievement



Direct Detection: Low-Mass WIMP Searches



- For low-mass WIMP searches the main goal is to lower the threshold and push down to lower masses
- Technically, this means lowering the threshold for measuring ionization or heat deposition
- We expect orders of magnitude improvement in cross-section sensitivity in the 1-10 GeV mass range



Direct Detection: DAMA / LIBRA



- Several experiments are reproducing DAMA / LIBRA scenario with increasing fidelity
- Expect to probe DAMA / LIBRA signal region with almost identical setup in next few year
 - This will test explanations offered for tension between DAMA / LIBRA signal region and exclusion regions of other experiments



Direct Detection: Axions & Axion Like Particles



- Low-mass Axions (~µeV) more "field-like" that "particle-like"
- Haloscopes: couple to local axions or axion-like particles in Galactic halo using tunable microwave resonating cavities and magnetic fields
- ADMX-2 will probe coupling-mass plane in region that would produce DM at the relic density between 2 41 μ eV



Direct Detection: Light Shining through a Wall



- Light Shining through a Wall: use powerful magnetic fields to convert photons to axions and back so that they can pass an optical barrier
- Current sensitivity not as good as Helioscopes (e.g., CAST), but ALPS-II upgrade would read CAST sensitivity as well as parts of cosmologically significant region

Direct Detection: Directional Detectors



- Directional detection: measure direction of recoiling electon or neutron
- Fundament challenge: extracting enough information to estimate direction before recoil particle direction is randomized by multiple scattering
 - This gets harder as the recoil energy goes down
- Gas approach: decrease the density of the target
 - Works, but reduces the target mass tremendously
- Other approaches: increasing the tracking resolution
 - This is hard, we are already very good at tracking



ACCELERATOR SEARCHES



Low Mass DM Searches



- Very nice summary talk describing numerous accelerator-based low mass DM searches probing "Heavy Photon" at 1-1000 MeV scale
- Complementary approaches: missing mass, energy, momentum, direct search for dark photons





Search for dark matter in A' invisible decay



- A' invisible decay (search for bump in recoil mass spectrum)
- A' decay to leptons (spectrum of γe⁺e⁻, γμ⁺μ⁻ doesn't match QED)
- Also sensitive to axions / axion like particles



DM / SUSY Searches at the LHC



- Several talks about searches for different topological signatures at the LHC
- As an outsider, biggest questions are: how they all tie together, and what are the implications for WIMPs as DM



Simplified Models




Making Sense of all the LHC SUSY Searches



- Complementary talks walking us through the implications of the numbers SUSY searches performed at the LHC:
- From experimental perspective, in the simplified model space, looking for particular topological signatures
 Felcini
- From the theoretical perspective, in SUSY parameters space, asking which particle is the LSP and hence the DM candidate

Aside: Spectral Features in Limit Curves



- Structured features in limit curves can indicate systematic limitations in the background modeling
- E.g., the background spectral model isn't quite right, or the emperically fit background model parameters are under-constrained & correlated with the signal



Aside: Spectral Features in Limit Curves

arXiv:1406.3430v1 (also: 1704.05458v1)



- Search for low-mass spectral lines with Fermi-LAT (in systematics dominated region)
- Use negative control, i.e., fits for signal in region where there should be no signal, to establish level at which model uncertainties can fake (or mask) a signal
- Apply this to constrain a nuisance "template" in the fitting procedure, reducing the significance of any signal at or below the systematic level



OUTLOOK

- Supersymmetry is too rich a theory to be easily excluded... Very different DM candidates are possible with various signatures !
- Nevertheless the simplest models of supersymmetric Dark Matter like Bino in the CMSSM are under siege and survive only in corners of the parameter space.
- On the other side Wino Dark Matter is also challenged by indirect detection thanks to the Sommerfeld enhancement.
- For gravitino Dark Matter a lot of parameter space is still viable, but the window for thermal leptogenesis may be closed soon by the LHC, if the gluino is not seen below ~2 TeV.
- Cosmologically though there are advantages to heavy SUSY, like scenarios for baryogenesis in RPV with gravitino DM !

Covi



DM Implications of LHC Searches



- Mono-jet search (red) looks for missing transverse energy from DM particle but is limited high missing energy cut need to reduce background
- Di-jet search (blue) looks for DM mediator particle producing pairs of SM particles and can reach higher energies



DM at future e⁺e⁻ colliders



- Study covered 4 different e⁺e⁻ collider scenarios, 2 storage rings and 2 linear colliders
- Test coupling to leptons
 - complementary to LHC and direct detection searches
- In event of SUSY discovery we can expect to determine relic density with few percent precision (similar to Planck)



INDIRECT DETECTION



Indirect Detection with Charged Particles



- Two spectral features that have generated excitement as potential dark matter signals:
 - Increase of positron fraction / spectral bump in total e⁺ + e⁻ spectrum above 10 GeV up to ~TeV Gebauer, Boudaud
 - Flatness of anti-proton to proton ratio above the geomagnetic cutoff
 Gebauer, Winkler



Interpretations of Positron Fraction



- Increase in the positron to electron ratio from 10 GeV up to > 100 GeV
- Caveat: both spectra are steeply falling (note factor of E³ in left-hand plot), the positron spectrum is just falling less steeply than the electron spectrum
- This implies some source of large number of electron / positron pairs at high energy
- Favored interpretations: dark matter or pulsar wind nebulae (PWNe)



PWNe can *Easily* **Explain Positron Spectrum**



 At least five PWNe are close enough and young enough (high spindown power) to produce the positron spectrum assuming reasonable efficiency for e⁺e⁻ pairs



Interpretation of Proton Spectrum



- Flatness of anti-proton to proton ratio was unexpected in 2015
 - "If anti-p are secondaries, their rigidity dependence should be different from p" Gebauer
- Boron/Carbon ratio measure by AMS-02 suggest propagation parameters should be updated, leading to flatter expected anti-p spectrum Winkler
- Updated measurements of cross-sections also lead to flatter expected anti-p spectrun



Comparison of Rigidity Spectra Presents Interesting Puzzle



- We expect secondaries (such as anti-p) to have softer spectra than primaries (p) because of their spectra steepens after they are produced, as the highest energies ones are more likely to escape the Galaxy
- We expect electron spectra to soften because of radiative energy losses



Other Developments (antideuterons & friends)



 Antideuterons are potentially good channel to look for DM signals, but must address geomagnetic deflection and uncertainties in production cross sections.



Galactic Particle Propagation Codes



Comparison of features, approximations, philosophy of existing Galactic particle propagation codes: GALPROP, PICARD, DRAGON, USINE



Indirect Detection with Neutrinos



- Searches for high-energy ν from Galactic Center sensitive to annihilation cross section
 - Strongest limits in some channels above ~30 TeV
- Searches for high-energy v from Sun sensitive to scattering cross section (in conjunction with annihilation cross section)



Solar Physics Probing Asymmetric DM



- Since asymmetric DM suppresses annihilation rate, the DM density of the sun can be much larger than it would be if the annihilation and capture rates were in equilibrium
- In this case the DM can affect the stellar heat transport, which can be probed, e.g., by helio-siesmology



Indirect Detection with γ Rays



 Many targets for indirect searches with γ rays, but here we focused on the Galactic center (where there is an excess w.r.t. diffuse emission models) and the dwarf spheroidal galaxies (which set the strongest constraints)



Astrophysics of the Galactic Center



- Galactic center is a very complicated astrophysical region
- Many phenomena that have been interpreted as potential DM signals
- For example, the 511 keV line seen at the Galactic center:
 - However, the GC 511 keV line seems to come from bound-state positronium, implying the positrons are produced at low energies (i.e., not from DM or pulsars)



Measuring J-factors in Dwarf Galaxies



- Moving from flux measurement to discuss of DM annihilation cross section depends on J-factors
- Many uncertainties in estimating the astrophysical J-factors of Dwarf Spheroidal (dSph) galaxies: velocity anisotropy, galaxy membership, light profile, region of integration



GeV Galactic Center Excess is Probably Pulsars



- "Best candidates [to explain the Galactic center GeV excess] are arguably millisecond pulsars in the Galactic bulge" Weniger
 - Highly significant (7-10σ with three complementary methods) observation that data favor a population of point sources with pulsar-like spectra
 - Population for ~10,000 millisecond pulsars in the bulge would give the flux needed to make the excess



Aside: Pulsar Populations





Position in Galactic Coordinates of All Known Pulsars (LAT-detected pulsars highlighted)



- Young pulsars are found closer to Galactic plane
- Millisecond pulsar are more isotropically distributed



Observational Horizon for Pulsars



- Most γ-ray detected
 pulsars are within 2 kpc
 - Even less for ms pulsars
 - GC at 8.5 kpc



Detecting Pulsars

Radio Detection in Intensity Time Series



- Pulsars are detected primarily in radio and γ-ray searches
- Radio searches: point radio array at pulsar, look for pulses
 - Weak towards galactic center where free electrons disperse pulse profile
- γ-ray searches:
 - Weak for binary searches where orbital motion modulates timing solution

γ-ray Detection: 1000 days of weighted photons phasefolded against timing solution





DM Limits from HESS Observations of GC

Constraints on the DM continuum signal



- For the Einasto profile, strongest limits so far in the TeV mass range:
 - → in the W⁺W⁻ channel: 6×10⁻²⁶ cm³ s⁻¹ at 1.5 TeV
- They well complement the Fermi-LAT limits down to about 300 GeV
- Full H.E.S.S.-II array observations within the inner Galaxy Survey programme with pointings up to 3° in Galactic latitudes started in 2015

Moulin



New Eyes on the γ-ray Skies



- Significant bands (~1MeV, ~few TeV, > PeV) where upcoming instruments will improve sensitivity by over an order of magnitude
- This will result in over 30 times more detected sources in those bands



COSMOLOGY & ASTROPHYSICAL DARK MATTER



Subhalo Structure Mass Function



- Both Cold and Warm DM are compatible with CMB & galaxy clustering
- Kinetic energy (temperature) of DM can suppress structure formation at small scales
- If we could see the dark matter directly, it would be very easy to distinguish Cold DM from Warm DM



Distinguishing Cold v. Warm DM



- EAGLE (?) Simulations tell us that the fraction of sub-halos that are "dark" goes from ~1 at $10^9 M_{\odot}$ to ~0 at $10^{10} M_{\odot}$
- This reduces the statistics in counting satellites, leaving ambiguity between WDM and CDM



Aside: Fermat's Principle and Lensing



Fermat's principle as a variational principle: paths near the path of least time to add constructively.

Aside: Gravitational Lensing

ESA/Hubble & NASA (Astronomy Picture of the Day 2011-12-21)

Gravitational time dilation means that light from lensed galaxy (behind) reaches us more quickly by travelling around the lensing galaxy (in front).



Aside: Strong Lensing



Light will appear for lines of sight where the gradient of the travel time is small: This includes minima, maxima and saddle points.



Key point for us: a strong lens creates a number of directions where the light travel time surface is flat: our sensitivity to lensing from sub-halos along these lines of sight is vastly improved



Einstein Ring Einstein Cross Weak Lensing

Light will appear for lines of sight where the gradient of the travel time is small: This includes minima, maxima and saddle points.



Measuring Strong Lensing Substructure Will Resolve CDM v. WDM

70





Self-interacting DM and Baryonic Feedback



- Simulations including realistic feedback from baryonic processes (e.g., star formation, supernovae) used to explore case for self-interacting DM (SIDM)
- With SIDM, Dwarf Galaxies are much less sensitive to feedback



Primordial Black Holes



- Unexpected large rate & mass of black holes in LIGO gravity wave detections lead to question: what fraction of DM is attributable to highmass primodial black holes
 - < 10-15 M_{\odot} : evaporation emits γ rays and puts energy back into CMB
 - $10^{-15} 10^2 M_{\odot}$: various lensing studies
 - > $2M_{\odot}$: emission from accretion


Neutrinos & Cosmology



- The CMB sees the neutrino background
- Future large surveys should be able to detect the neutrino mass and strongly constrain WDM properties / see CDM velocity dispersion
- For MeV WDM cross section for annihilation to vv sets relic abundance



Euclid is Sensitive to Warm Dark Matter



- Euclid will greatly extend galaxy surveys for redshifts 1-2 (7-10 Gyr ago)
- This will improve constraints on structure growth rate and cosmic expansion
 - Could constrain m_{WDM}<2 keV



Meta Summary



- No convincing (or even particularly compelling) DM signals in any searches: be they direct, indirect or accelerator-based
 - Some things that have been interpreted as signals are now strongly disfavored by other measurements (e.g., DAMA/LIBRA) or face strong competing hypotheses (e.g., positron fraction, Galactic center GeV excess)
 - Some interesting observations that merit careful follow up: (Helioseismology anomoly, particle rigidities)
- This is a great application of the scientific method: we are finding ways of testing (and falsifying) hypotheses & developing new hypotheses
- Dark matter is more interesting that a simple ~100 GeV thermal relic WIMP



- Many impressive efforts are underway:
 - to understand what the astrophysical data are telling us about the nature of dark matter
 - to continue to test the dominant WIMP paradigm by building more sensitive experiments and better understanding backgrounds
 - to develop ways to test other types of DM candidates
- This is a great application of the scientific method: we are finding ways of testing (and falsifying) hypotheses & developing new hypotheses
- We know that dark matter exists, perhaps we might be very lucky the discover that its particle nature is more interesting than, say, a ~100 GeV thermal relic WIMP from one of the simpler SUSY models



THANK YOU

