Dynamics of bigravity and general relativity

- Introduction
- Homothetic solution
- FLRW universe
- Bianchi universe
- Observational consequence ?

Waseda University Kei-ichi Maeda

with K. Aoki (in preparation) & M. Volkov PRD87 (2013) 104009



### Question:

An accelerating universe is naturally found?

- Stability of FLRW universe
- de Sitter : attractor ? cosmic no hair conjecture

### In GR with a cosmological constant

**cosmic no hair theorem** (Wald 83) **for Bianchi spacetime** 

Any anisotropic homogeneous spacetime except for type IX is always isotropized and de Sitter solution is realized. (Type IX :  ${}^{(3)}R_{\max} < 2\Lambda$  initially  $\rightarrow$  de Sitter )

- Inhomogeneous case → Schwarzschild-de Sitter solution large black holes are not formed (Shiromizu et al 93) in asymptotically de Sitter spacetime
- GR+ a cosmological constant: attractor ?



- Homothetic solution gives (GR+ a cosmological constant)
  - stability against perturbations
- FLRW universe (homogeneous and isotropic spacetime)
  - existence condition of de Sitter solution Aoki, KM (in prep.)

KM, Volkov ('13)

- matter effect on dynamics
- Bianchi universe (homogeneous but anisotropic spacetime)
  - homothetic solution is an attractor
  - **I** the shear density drops as  $a^{-3}$  (In GR  $a^{-6}$  )
  - chaotic behaviour in Type IX
- Observational consequence ?
  - Equation of state of DE ?
  - cosmological constant with dark matter ?

Bigravity theory

 $g_{\mu
u}, f_{\mu
u}$  two metrics

$$S[g, f, \text{matter}] = \frac{1}{2\kappa_g^2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} R(g) + \frac{1}{2\kappa_f^2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-f} \mathcal{R}(f)$$

$$-\frac{m^2}{\kappa^2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \,\mathscr{U}[g,f] + S_g^{[m]}[g,g-\text{matter}] + S_f^{[m]}[f,\text{f-matter}]$$
  
ion term 
$$\kappa^2 = \kappa_g^2 + \kappa_f^2$$

Interaction term

*m* : graviton mass a flat space is a solution

$$b_0 = 4c_3 + c_4 - 6, \quad b_1 = 3 - 3c_3 - c_4, \\ b_2 = 2c_3 + c_4 - 1, \quad b_3 = -(c_3 + c_4), \quad b_4 = c_4.$$

two free coupling constants  $C_3, C_4$ 

### **Basic equations**

 $G_{\mu\nu} = \kappa_g^2 \left| T_{\mu\nu}^{[\gamma]} + T_{\mu\nu}^{[m]} \right|$ 

$$\mathcal{G}_{\mu
u} = \kappa_f^2 \left[ \mathcal{T}^{[\gamma]}_{\mu
u} + \, \mathcal{T}^{[\mathrm{m}]}_{\,\mu
u} 
ight]$$

 $\kappa_g^2 T^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = m_g^2 (\tau^{\mu}{}_{\nu} - \mathscr{U} \delta^{\mu}_{\nu}) \qquad \qquad \kappa_f^2 \mathcal{T}^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = -m_f^2 \frac{\sqrt{-g}}{\sqrt{-f}} \tau^{\mu}{}_{\nu},$ 

 $\begin{aligned} \tau^{\mu}_{\ \nu} &= \{b_1 \,\mathscr{U}_0 + b_2 \,\mathscr{U}_1 + b_3 \,\mathscr{U}_2 + b_4 \,\mathscr{U}_3\} \gamma^{\mu}_{\ \nu} - \{b_2 \,\mathscr{U}_0 + b_3 \,\mathscr{U}_1 + b_4 \,\mathscr{U}_2\} (\gamma^2)^{\mu}_{\ \nu} \\ &+ \{b_3 \,\mathscr{U}_0 + b_4 \,\mathscr{U}_1\} (\gamma^3)^{\mu}_{\ \nu} - b_4 \,\mathscr{U}_0 \,(\gamma^4)^{\mu}_{\ \nu} \\ \gamma^{\mu}_{\ \mu} &= \epsilon \sqrt{g^{\mu\alpha} f_{\alpha\nu}} \end{aligned}$ 

### energy-momentum conservation

$$\begin{aligned} &\stackrel{(g)}{\nabla}_{\mu} T^{[m]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0, \qquad \stackrel{(f)}{\nabla}_{\mu} \mathcal{T}^{[m]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0 \\ &\stackrel{(g)}{\nabla}_{\mu} T^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0. \qquad \stackrel{(f)}{\nabla}_{\mu} \mathcal{T}^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0 \end{aligned}$$

**homothetic metrics:**  $f_{\mu\nu} = K^2 g_{\mu\nu} \Rightarrow \gamma^{\mu}_{\ \nu} = K \delta^{\mu}_{\ \nu}$ 

$$\kappa_g^2 T^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = -\Lambda_g(K) \delta^{\mu}{}_{\nu}, \ \kappa_f^2 \mathcal{T}^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = -\Lambda_f(K) \delta^{\mu}{}_{\nu}$$

$$\Lambda_g(K) = m_g^2 \left( b_0 + 3b_1 K + 3b_2 K^2 + b_3 K^3 \right)$$

$$\Lambda_f(K) = m_f^2 \left( b_1 / K^3 + 3b_2 / K^2 + 3b_3 / K + b_4 \right)$$

$$\begin{pmatrix} g \\ \nabla_{\mu} T^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0 & \begin{pmatrix} f \\ \nabla_{\mu} \mathcal{T}^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0 & \end{pmatrix} \quad \textbf{K: constant}$$

$$GR \text{ with a cosmological constant}$$

$$G_{\mu\nu} + \Lambda_g g_{\mu\nu} = \kappa_g^2 T^{[m]}_{\mu\nu}$$

$$\Lambda_g(K) = K^2 \Lambda_f(K) : \text{ quartic equation for } K$$

$$T^{[m]}_{\mu\nu} = K^2 \mathcal{T}^{[m]}_{\mu\nu}$$

de Sitter

homothetic solution  $\Lambda_g > 0$ 

perturbations around a homothetic solution

$$g_{\mu\nu} = g_{\mu\nu}^{(0)} + h_{\mu\nu}, \quad f_{\mu\nu} := K^2 \tilde{f}_{\mu\nu} = K^2 \left( g_{\mu\nu}^{(0)} + k_{\mu\nu} \right)$$

$$\psi_{\mu\nu} := m_f^2 h_{\mu\nu} + K^2 m_g^2 k_{\mu\nu}$$

$$\varphi_{\mu\nu} := h_{\mu\nu} - k_{\mu\nu}$$

$$\varphi_{\mu\nu} := h_{\mu\nu} - k_{\mu\nu}$$

$$\varphi_{\mu\nu} := \varphi_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2} \varphi g_{\mu\nu}^{(0)}$$

$$\bar{\varphi}_{\mu\nu} := \varphi_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2} \varphi g_{\mu\nu}^{(0)}$$

$$\bar{\varphi}_{\mu\nu} = 0 \qquad massless mode$$

$$\bar{\psi}_{\mu\nu} - \left(\frac{2}{3}\Lambda_g + m_{eff}^2\right) \bar{\varphi}_{\mu\nu} = 0 \qquad 2 \nabla^{\mu} \bar{\varphi}_{\mu\nu} = 0 \qquad \bar{\varphi} = 0$$

$$massive mode \qquad m_{eff}^2 = \left(m_g^2 + \frac{m_f^2}{K^2}\right) (b_1 K + 2b_2 K^2 + b_3 K^3)$$

$$\bar{\psi} \qquad \text{stable}$$

### general vacuum homothetic background

### **FLRW** universe

g-spacetimeFLRW spacetime $ds_g^2 = -\alpha^2 dt^2 + a_g^2 \gamma_{ij} dx_i dx_j$ f-spacetimespherically symmetric spacetime

two cases:

■ non-bidiagonal  $\implies$  g- and f- spacetimes are decoupled  $(GR(g) + \Lambda_g) \times (GR(f) + \Lambda_f)$ 

bidiagonal

$$ds_f^2 = -\mathcal{A}^2 dt^2 + a_f^2 \gamma_{ij} dx_i dx_j$$

$$\overset{(g)}{\nabla}_{\mu} T^{[\gamma]\mu}{}_{\nu} = 0. \qquad \Longrightarrow \qquad \left(\frac{\mathcal{A}}{\alpha} - \frac{\dot{a}_f}{\dot{a}_g}\right) \left(b_1 + 2b_2B + b_3B^2\right) = 0 \qquad \qquad B = a_f/a_g$$

special solution



$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{d_g^2}{\alpha^2 a_g^2} = \kappa_g^2 \rho_g^{[\gamma]} + \kappa_g^2 \rho_g \\ & \frac{d_f^2}{\alpha^2 a_g^2} = \kappa_f^2 \rho_f^{[\gamma]} + \kappa_g^2 \rho_g \\ & \frac{d_f^2}{\mathcal{A}^2 a_f^2} = \kappa_f^2 \rho_f^{[\gamma]} + \kappa_f^2 \rho_f \end{aligned} \qquad \begin{aligned} & \kappa_g^2 \rho_g^{[\gamma]} = m_g^2 \left( b_0 + 3b_1 B + 3b_2 B^2 + b_3 B^3 \right) \\ & \kappa_f^2 \rho_f^{[\gamma]} = m_f^2 \left( b_4 + 3\frac{b_3}{B} + 3\frac{b_2}{B^2} + \frac{b_1}{B^3} \right) \\ & m_g^2 = m^2 \kappa_g^2 / \kappa^2 \quad m_f^2 = m^2 \kappa_f^2 / \kappa^2 \end{aligned}$$

### Matter : radiation + dust

$ \rho_g =$	$\frac{c_{gm}}{a_g^3} -$	$+ \frac{c_{gr}}{a_g^4}$	$\rho_f = \frac{c_{fm}}{a_f^3} + \frac{c_{fr}}{a_f^4}$	$B = \frac{a_f}{a_g}$

$$\implies \dot{B}^2 + V_g(B; c_{gm}, c_{gr}, c_{fm}, c_{fr}) = 0$$

### [1] vacuum

$$B = B_{\rm vac} \ ({\rm constant})$$

$$\kappa_g^2 \rho_g^{[\gamma]}(B_{\text{vac}}) - \kappa_f^2 B_{\text{vac}}^2 \rho_f^{[\gamma]}(B_{\text{vac}}) = 0$$

 $\implies$  homothetic solution  $f_{\mu\nu} = B_{\rm vac}^2 g_{\mu\nu}$ 

### quartic equation

$$\begin{split} B_{\mathrm{vac}} &= 1 & \mathsf{Minkowski} & (\mathsf{stable}) \\ \Lambda_g &= \kappa_g^2 \rho_g^{[\gamma]}(B_{\mathrm{vac}}) & \mathsf{cosmological \ constant} \\ & \Lambda_g &> 0 & 1 \ \mathsf{dS} & (\mathsf{stable}) \\ & \Lambda_g &< 0 & 2 \ \mathsf{AdS} & (\mathsf{unstable}) \end{split}$$





 $\hat{C_3}$ 

2

4

6

-2

-4

-6

-2  $\overset{\circ}{C_3}$ -6 -4 2 6 4



t

2.5

2.0

1.5

1.0

0.5

0.0

 $a_g$ 



### matter effect

### dS (homothetic sol)





• singularity







### For the coupling constants with de Sitter homothetic solution,

there always exist a finite range of initial values, in which de Sitter spacetime is realized asymptotically.

### **Bianchi Spacetimes**

 $[\xi_a, \xi_b] = C^c_{\ ab}\xi_c \qquad \xi_a : \text{Killing vectors}$  $C^{c}_{\ ab} = n^{cd} \epsilon_{dab} + a(\delta^{1}_{a}\delta^{c}_{b} - \delta^{1}_{b}\delta^{c}_{a}) \qquad n^{ab} = \text{diag}[n^{(1)}, n^{(2)}, n^{(3)}]$  $ds_q^2 = -\alpha^2 dt^2 + e^{2\Omega} e^{2\beta_{ij}} \omega_i \omega_j \qquad ds_f^2 = -\mathcal{A}^2 dt^2 + e^{2\mathcal{W}} e^{2\mathcal{B}_{ij}} \omega_i \omega_j$  $(\beta_{ij}) = \begin{pmatrix} \beta_+ + \sqrt{3}\beta_- & 0 & 0\\ 0 & \beta_+ - \sqrt{3}\beta_- & 0\\ 0 & 0 & -2\beta_+ \end{pmatrix}$  $(\mathcal{B}_{ij}) = \begin{pmatrix} \mathcal{B}_+ + \sqrt{3}\mathcal{B}_- & 0 & 0\\ 0 & \mathcal{B}_+ - \sqrt{3}\mathcal{B}_- & 0\\ 0 & 0 & -2\mathcal{B}_+ \end{pmatrix}.$ 

### Bianchi I

$$S = \frac{3}{\kappa_g^2} \int d^4x \frac{e^{3\Omega}}{\alpha} \left( -\dot{\Omega}^2 + \dot{\beta}_+^2 + \dot{\beta}_-^2 \right)$$
$$+ \frac{3}{\kappa_f^2} \int d^4x \frac{e^{3\mathcal{W}}}{\mathcal{A}} \left( -\dot{\mathcal{W}}^2 + \dot{\mathcal{B}}_+^2 + \dot{\mathcal{B}}_-^2 \right) - \frac{m^2}{\kappa^2} \int d^4x (\alpha V_g + \mathcal{A}\mathcal{V}_f)$$

$$\begin{split} V_{g} &= - \begin{bmatrix} b_{0}e^{3\Omega} + b_{3}e^{3W} + b_{1}e^{W+2\Omega} \left( e^{-2(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})} + 2e^{\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+}}\cosh[\sqrt{3}(\mathcal{B}_{-}-\beta_{-})] \right) \\ &+ b_{2}e^{2W+\Omega} \left( e^{2(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})} + 2e^{-(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})}\cosh[\sqrt{3}(\mathcal{B}_{-}-\beta_{-})] \right) \\ \mathcal{V}_{f} &= - \begin{bmatrix} b_{1}e^{3\Omega} + b_{4}e^{3W} + b_{2}e^{W+2\Omega} \left( e^{-2(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})} + 2e^{\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+}}\cosh[\sqrt{3}(\mathcal{B}_{-}-\beta_{-})] \right) \\ &+ b_{3}e^{2W+\Omega} \left( e^{2(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})} + 2e^{-(\mathcal{B}_{+}-\beta_{+})}\cosh[\sqrt{3}(\mathcal{B}_{-}-\beta_{-})] \right) \end{bmatrix} \\ \end{split}$$

 $\frac{1}{2}\dot{\Omega}^{2} = \frac{1}{2}\left(\dot{\beta}_{+}^{2} + \dot{\beta}_{-}^{2}\right) + \frac{m_{g}^{2}}{6}\alpha^{2}e^{-3\Omega}V_{g} + \frac{\alpha^{2}\kappa_{g}^{2}}{6}\rho_{g}^{(m)}$  $\ddot{\Omega} - \frac{\dot{\alpha}}{\alpha}\dot{\Omega} + 3\dot{\Omega}^2 = \frac{m_g^2}{6}\alpha e^{-3\Omega} \left[ \alpha \left( 3V_g + \frac{\partial V_g}{\partial \Omega} \right) + \mathcal{A}\frac{\partial \mathcal{V}_f}{\partial \Omega} \right] + \frac{\alpha^2 \kappa_g^2}{2} \left( \rho_g^{(m)} - P_g^{(m)} \right)$  $\ddot{\beta}_{\pm} - \frac{\dot{\alpha}}{\alpha}\dot{\beta}_{\pm} + 3\dot{\Omega}\dot{\beta}_{\pm} = -\frac{m_g^2}{6}\alpha e^{-3\Omega} \left(\alpha\frac{\partial V_g}{\partial\beta_+} + \mathcal{A}\frac{\partial \mathcal{V}_f}{\partial\beta_+}\right)$ 

 $\frac{1}{2}\dot{\mathcal{W}}^2 = \frac{1}{2}\left(\dot{\mathcal{B}}_+^2 + \dot{\mathcal{B}}_-^2\right) + \frac{m_f^2}{6}\mathcal{A}^2 e^{-3\mathcal{W}}\mathcal{V}_f + \frac{\mathcal{A}^2\kappa_f^2}{6}\rho_f^{(\mathrm{m})}$  $\ddot{\mathcal{W}} - \frac{\dot{\mathcal{A}}}{\mathcal{A}}\dot{\mathcal{W}} + 3\dot{\mathcal{W}}^2 = \frac{m_f^2}{6}\mathcal{A}e^{-3\mathcal{W}}\left[\alpha\frac{\partial V_g}{\partial \mathcal{W}} + \mathcal{A}\left(3\mathcal{V}_f + \frac{\partial \mathcal{V}_f}{\partial \mathcal{W}}\right)\right] + \frac{\mathcal{A}^2\kappa_f^2}{2}\left(\rho_f^{(m)} - P_f^{(m)}\right)$  $\ddot{\mathcal{B}}_{\pm} - \frac{\mathcal{A}}{\mathcal{A}}\dot{\mathcal{B}}_{\pm} + 3\dot{\mathcal{W}}\dot{\mathcal{B}}_{\pm} = -\frac{m_f^2}{6}\mathcal{A}e^{-3\mathcal{W}}\left(\alpha\frac{\partial V_g}{\partial \mathcal{B}_+} + \mathcal{A}\frac{\partial \mathcal{V}_f}{\partial \mathcal{B}_+}\right)$ 

 $m_g^2 = \frac{m^2 \kappa_g^2}{\kappa^2}, \quad m_f^2 = \frac{m^2 \kappa_f^2}{\kappa^2}$ 



$$\mathcal{B}_{\pm} = \beta_{\pm} \qquad \Longrightarrow \qquad e^{3\Omega} \frac{\dot{\beta}_{\pm}}{\alpha} = \sigma_{\pm(0)}, \qquad e^{3\mathcal{W}} \frac{\dot{\mathcal{B}}_{\pm}}{\mathcal{A}} = S_{\pm(0)}$$
$$e^{3(\mathcal{W}-\Omega)} \frac{\alpha}{\mathcal{A}} = \frac{\mathcal{S}_{+(0)}}{\sigma_{+(0)}} = \frac{\mathcal{S}_{-(0)}}{\sigma_{-(0)}} \equiv C^2$$

Hamiltonian constraints + EOM

$$\left[\alpha \left(e^{\mathcal{W}}\right)^{\cdot} - \mathcal{A}\left(e^{\Omega}\right)^{\cdot}\right] \left(b_1 + 2b_2 e^{\mathcal{W} - \Omega} + b_3 e^{2(\mathcal{W} - \Omega)}\right) = 0$$

(1) 
$$\alpha \left( e^{\mathcal{W}} \right)^{\cdot} - \mathcal{A} \left( e^{\Omega} \right)^{\cdot} = 0.$$

$$f_{\mu\nu} = C^2 g_{\mu\nu} \quad \text{homothetic} \quad C = K$$
(2)  $b_1 + 2b_2 e^{W-\Omega} + b_3 e^{2(W-\Omega)} = 0 \quad e^{W-\Omega} = \xi_0$ 

$$\mathcal{A} = \sqrt{\frac{\Lambda_g(\xi_0)}{\Lambda_f(\xi_0)}} \,\alpha$$
$$e^{\mathcal{W}} = \xi_0 \, e^{\Omega}$$

$$\rho_f = \frac{\Lambda_f(\xi_0)}{\Lambda_g(\xi_0)} \, \rho_g$$

# homothetic solution=vacuum Bianchi I with a cosmological constant $\Lambda$ in GR analytic solution

$$\begin{split} \Lambda > 0 \\ e^{\Omega} &= \frac{1}{2^{1/3}} e^{\pm H_0(t-t_0)} \left( 1 - \frac{\sigma_0^2}{H_0^2} e^{\mp 6H_0(t-t_0)} \right)^{1/3} \quad H_0 = \sqrt{\Lambda/3} \\ e^{\beta_{\pm}} &= e^{\beta_{\pm(0)}} \left( \frac{1 - \frac{\sigma_0}{H_0} e^{\mp 3H_0(t-t_0)}}{1 + \frac{\sigma_0}{H_0} e^{\mp 3H_0(t-t_0)}} \right)^{\pm \frac{\sigma_{\pm}^{(0)}}{3\sigma_0}} \quad \frac{\sigma_0^2 = \sigma_{\pm(0)}^2 + \sigma_{-(0)}^2}{\Sigma^2 = \frac{\sigma^2}{H^2} \propto e^{-6\Omega}} \end{split}$$

### Homothetic solution is an attractor in Bianchi I

$$\mathcal{B}_{\pm} - \beta_{\pm} \to 0$$



$$H_g = \sqrt{\Lambda_g/3}$$

### More General Bianchi Types





Approach to homothetic metrics

**homothetic solution**  $\implies$  GR with a cosmological constant

Shear drops fast as 
$$\sigma^2 \sim \dot{eta}_+^2 + \dot{eta}_-^2 \sim e^{-6\Omega}$$

However, it does not drop so fast:

 $\sigma^2 \sim \dot{\beta}_+^2 + \dot{\beta}_-^2 \sim e^{-3\Omega}$ 

This is the same as matter fluid

Any Observational Effect ?

### de Sitter spacetime is not always an attractor

### Closed FLRW universe

$$\dot{\mathbf{a}}^2 + V(\mathbf{a}) = -k \ (k=1)$$



$$\rho_1/m^4 = 0.1 \times e^{-4\Omega}$$

bounce -> de Sitter  $ho_2/m^4 = 0.25 \times e^{-4\Omega} + 0.25 \times e^{-3\Omega}$ 

collapse -> singularity

### Initial Stage (near singularity)



### Bianchi IX



### vacuum Bianchi IX







### **Observational constraints**





## Summary

We discuss dynamics of bigravity

 A homothetic solution corresponds to that in GR with a cosmological constant
 The homothetic solution with a positive (or zero) cosmological constant is an attractor in FLRW and Bianchi class A spacetimes

→ cosmic no hair

There may be observational constraints



More generic spacetimes

Homothetic solution (GR+ $\Lambda$ ) is also an attractor for inhomogeneous spacetimes ?

Cosmic no hair conjecture ?

Black hole uniqueness ?

## Thank you for your attention

